



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/685,303	10/14/2003	Graham M. Stuart	1088-00017	9832
7590	11/25/2005		EXAMINER	
Joseph J. Jochman ANDRUS, SCEALES, STARKE & SAWALL, LLP Suite 1100 100 East Wisconsin Avenue Milwaukee, WI 53202-4178			KRISHNAMURTHY, RAMESH	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			3753	
DATE MAILED: 11/25/2005				

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
	10/685,303	STUART, GRAHAM M.	
	Examiner	Art Unit	
	Ramesh Krishnamurthy	3753	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 14 April 2005.
 2a) This action is FINAL. 2b) This action is non-final.
 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

4) Claim(s) 1-6 is/are pending in the application.
 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
 5) Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
 6) Claim(s) 1-5 is/are rejected.
 7) Claim(s) 6 is/are objected to.
 8) Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
 10) The drawing(s) filed on 26 February 2004 is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 a) All b) Some * c) None of:
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
 2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
 3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____.
 4) Interview Summary (PTO-413)
 Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____.
 5) Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
 6) Other: _____.

This office action is responsive to communications filed 04/14/2005.

Claims 1 – 6 are pending.

1. The disclosure is objected to because of the following informalities: The specification lacks proper section headings such as Introduction, Summary of Invention, Brief Description of Drawings, etc. See MPEP 608.01(a).

Appropriate correction is required.

2. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

3. Claims 1 – 3 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Thiltgen (US 5,036,875).

Thiltgen discloses a valve mechanism (Figs. 1– 8) including a moveable valve member (74), spring means (80) resiliently biasing the moveable member towards a first position i.e. closed position and linkage means (See Figs. 2 - 4) retaining the moveable member in a second position i.e. open position including a chemically sensitive device (90) which is arranged to release in the presence of a contaminant. The chemically sensitive means comprises an elongate member having at least one end near (98) whose surface is frictionally engaged by a cooperating member of the mechanism and is adapted to be chemically degraded by the contaminant so that the frictional engagement is lost.

4. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

5. Claims 4 and 5 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Thiltgen (US 5,036,875).

Thiltgen discloses the claimed invention with the exception of explicitly disclosing the moveable member to comprise a butterfly that is rotatably mounted in a conduit.

Thiltgen discloses the moveable member to be a rotatably disposed flapper that is configured to close the conduit when the chemically sensitive device is actuated. To replace the pivoted flapper with a pivoted butterfly is a design expedient over those features disclosed in Thiltgen in that it neither solves any stated problem nor provides any new and/or unexpected result. The rotatably disposed flapper in Thiltgen is equally effective in shutting off the flow under desired conditions and would be equally effective with a butterfly valve.

The linkage means comprises a crank (Figs. 2 – 4) connected to the rotatable mountings of the valve member (74) and tension spring (80) connecting the crank arm to affixed point so as to bias it to the closed position, the chemically sensitive device being arranged to retain the crank in the open position.

6. Claim 6 is objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

Art Unit: 3753

7. The prior art made of record and not relied upon is considered pertinent to applicant's disclosure.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Ramesh Krishnamurthy whose telephone number is (571) 272 – 4914. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday - Friday from 10:00 AM to 6:30 PM.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Stephen L. Blau, can be reached on (571) 272 – 4406. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is (571) 273 – 8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).



Ramesh Krishnamurthy, Ph.D., PE
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 3753